Journal of the Medical Library Association (JMLA) **Reviewer's Form** 2015 RF-B

Manuscript title: _____

Please respond in each of the 5 areas. Sections I through IV are confidential, will not be shared with authors.

I. Brief summary of the manuscript. What are they describing? Are the conclusions exploratory or conclusive?

II. Strengths of the manuscript (check as many as applicable)
__ Exceptionally well written, easy to read
__ Introduction section is brief and succinct
__ Appeals to a wide segment of *JMLA* readers, or is very important to the profession
__ Provides definitive answers because the research model has no important weaknesses
__ Other _____
__ None of the above

III. Limitations (check as many as applicable) **Be sure to identify in Section IV or V.**
__ Hard to read in places
__ Did not have an adequate comparison or control group
__ Research model has other limitations (see list below; circle as appropriate or add)
__ One or more conclusions/assertions overreached the data presented (assertion may be correct, but not based on data presented)
__ Had more references than were necessary
__ Used jargon without explaining it
__ Writing tone was not friendly (was condescending or aloof or overly simplistic or other)

IV. Message to editor
(A) I recommend (check one) ____ do not accept   __ ask author to resubmit with major changes
__ ask author to resubmit with minor changes   __ accept (could include need for a few minor edits).

(B) Comments to editor:

V. Comments to author(s) [Number comments] (Do not indicate your recommendation here.) (Be specific, to help the author rewrite)

> **NOTE: Common research limitations**: used a convenience sample; small numbers; did not completely assure objectivity—did not have mechanisms to prevent researchers' influence on results; did not test a hypothesis, instead tended to be a "fishing trip" looking for anything that might have $P<0.05$ (this might be OK in a deliberately exploratory analysis, if so labeled); failed to adjust for multiple comparisons. (Often good research cannot be done without some limitations; however, limitations are used in determining priority for publication.)